



ISO/IEC JTC1/SC7
Software Engineering
Secretariat: CANADA (SCC)

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC7 N2247

2000/01/27

Document Type	Memo
Title	JTC1/SC7 WG7 Commenting Guide For The Upcoming Ballot of 15288.
Source	JTC1/SC7 WG7 Editor
Project	
Status	Final
References	
Action ID	FYI or ACT
Due Date	
Mailing Date	2000/01/27
Distribution	SC7_AG
Medium	Encoded Acrobat
No. of Pages	6
Note	Due to the large number of comments expected at the next ballot of 15288, Member Bodies are invited to submit their comments according to these rules.

Commenting guide

Executive summary

1. Use the comment template.
2. Identify comments in the requested manner.
3. Provide a clear description of the problem and rationale for the change.
4. Provide proposed text to help understanding and to facilitate acceptance of the comment.
(Comments that define a problem but that provide no proposed solution will be treated as having "Insufficient information for implementation of a solution".)
5. Use Editorial category only for grammar, spelling, punctuation and readability problems.
6. Don't use General comments now that the document is maturing.
 - If General comments must be submitted, then put them in the maturity assessment.
 - If General comments must be submitted, then provide the full proposed text for the updated document.
7. If possible, list comments in top down priority sequence i.e. Technical High and Technical Low and within each by importance.
8. Comments that affect more than one part of the document should be cross-referenced with an absolute reference e.g. AUS-123 (not "see next comment") after final numbering.
9. Do not use any non-character highlighting e.g strike through, bolding, italics, colour, type face or point size. (Characters such as " or ' etc may be used.)

Introduction

This document outlines the WG 7 preferred approach to dealing with comments in general and particularly for situations where large numbers of comments are expected.

At the CD1 ballot of ISO/IEC 15288 in October 1999, WG 7 had to deal with 766 comments. This experience lead to a demand for more detailed guidance and a more formal process for dealing with large numbers of comments. Inspiration was also taken from the work of ISO TC176 where:

"... in January 1999, approximately 5200 specific comments were processed by ISO/TC 176/SC 2/WG 18 on the first committee drafts of ISO 9001 (3800 comments) and ISO 9004 (1400 comments), along with numerous general comments. Additionally, a number of proposals were presented in separate papers for consideration. ... Some 6400 specific comments were received against ISO/CD1 9000, ISO/CD1 9001 and ISO/CD1 9004 in total. It was only possible to collate and process these comments in a reasonable timeframe because the majority were submitted electronically, in a standardized format, that could be readily sorted."

From ISO/TC 176/SC 2/N434 Guideline notes for the submission of comments on ISO/CD2 9001:2000 and ISO/CD2 9004:2000, and also on ISO/CD2 9000:2000.

The majority of the CD1 comments received by WG 7 were in a standardized electronic format but it was felt that further guidance would be useful to facilitate a more consistent and effective commenting process.

This document will be maintained as a standing document and will be updated as required and in conjunction with:

- Commenting template
- Comment template and database - Project Editor's guide
- Comment database
- Comment disposition guide

Comment identification

SC 7 Resolution 478 provides that the comment identifier be CCC-N XX where:

CCC	National Body identifier using the ISO 3166 three character country code
N	Sequence number for the comment set
XX	Comment category: E Editorial G General TL Technical Low (minor) TH Technical High (major)

Comment template

Large numbers of submitted comments mean that even simple analysis tasks become extremely time consuming. The use of a template greatly accelerates the initial processing of comments allowing more time to review and analyze the comments prior to comment disposition.

It would be appreciated if comments were only submitted electronically using the commenting template that is provided. This template is made available in accordance with SC 7 Resolution 574 as an Excel 97 spreadsheet. An Excel 95 format is also provided but this does have limitations in terms of the number of characters of text that can be entered in a single cell.

If comments are not provided using the Excel 97 commenting template, conversion errors and truncation of text could occur.

Note that the data in the spreadsheet is imported into an Access 97 database for comment processing. This imposes constraints upon the formatting that can be successfully taken from Excel to Access.

Using the template

Comment files

Following these points helps to facilitate accurate management and manipulation of the comments, particularly where multiple documents are being commented.

1.	The standard SC 7 Excel 97 format is preferred so that it is possible to take advantage of the expanded cell capacity. If necessary, for Excel 95, a long comment can be provided in two parts by repeating the comment identification, but with the next (unique) ID number. "(cont)" should be inserted at the start of the continuing comment text.
2.	The spreadsheet file should be named to facilitate tracking and import into the database e.g. AUS_N1234 where AUS is the three character country code and N1234 is the number of the document being commented upon.
3.	Large amounts of text and figures should be provided individually as a separate attachment for each comment. They should be identified so that they can be easily traced to the source comment e.g. for comment AUS-1 use AUS-1_Figure_1.ppt or AUS-1_additional_text.doc.
4.	The spreadsheet footer should not be changed as it: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• identifies the soft copy filename so hard copy and soft copy can be easily matched• identifies how many pages of comments exist.

Mandatory fields

These fields are required so that comments can be imported into the database.

National Body	Enter the appropriate three letter code from Table 1 - ISO 3166 country codes e.g. AUS, JPN, USA. (A full list of codes may be found in ISO 3166 "Codes for the representation of names of countries".) (Conformance facilitates database import and sorting.)
ID	Enter a unique, sequential number starting from 1 to number the comments. This can be done using the Microsoft Excel "Edit, Fill, Series" command after the comments have been finalized. (Conformance facilitates database import and sorting.)
Category	Classify the comment as: TH Technical High TL Technical Low E Editorial G General (Note: If possible, avoid using this category especially for mature documents. General comments should be covered instead by multiple specific comments to ensure that each and every instance is addressed.) (Conformance facilitates database import and sorting.)
Comment and rationale	State the details of the comment and the rationale (why it exists). The rationale may be important in assisting understanding at the comment resolution meeting. (Conformance facilitates database import.)

Optional fields

Please note the following to improve understanding, accurate comment analysis and disposition.

Clause, Sub- Clause	It is preferable to always complete this field i.e. by avoiding General comments. Identify the Clause or Sub-Clause exactly as it appears in the source document e.g. Introduction, 4.2.1 or Annex B.1. Avoid using "All" or "Global". (Conformance facilitates database sorting.)
Paragraph, Figure, Table	Identify the Paragraph number, Figure number or Table number from the source document e.g. Paragraph 2, or Figure 1, or Table 2. (Conformance facilitates database sorting.)
Proposed new text	Provide new/alternative text, exactly as it is intended to appear in the revised document. This helps to convey good understanding of the intent of the comment and facilitates easier implementation of the changes by the Project Editor. If this is missing, much unproductive time can be spent in trying to understand and resolve what was intended. In the worst case it may be necessary to reject the comment.

Clause

1.	Ensure that every row of the comment spreadsheet indicates to which Clause the comment refers. Merging cells to allow separation by rows of different comments against a single entry for a Clause will prevent database import.
2.	Do not precede the Clause by a 'Carriage return' or 'Enter' or '␣' keystroke, as the sort function will sort the comments by this keystroke in preference to the Clause number.
3.	Do not precede the Clause or paragraph number by typing words such as 'Clause'.
4.	Do not use words for the Clause, e.g. do not use "Scope" instead of "1". For those items where a word description is appropriate (e.g. Title, Foreword, Annex), enter the word in full.
5.	Ensure that the numbers for an individual Clause are correctly separated by "full stops" or "periods" e.g. do not use colons or dashes.

Comments

To facilitate effective implementation of comments as intended, please note these points.

1.	Each comment should be self-contained i.e. it should not make broad reference to previous or other documents. Instead, include the exact proposal for alternative text.
2.	It is preferable to repeat text, rather than cross reference sets of related comments as the disposition may vary because of other related comments. During the disposition process, comments will be sorted into other sequences thus rendering follow on comments incomprehensible.
3.	If it is necessary to cross reference to another comment in the same set, do this with an absolute cross-reference after the full set has been uniquely numbered.
4.	Do not 'Hide' rows to remove them.
5.	Ensure that any blank rows are deleted from within the comment set.

Formatting

1.	Use the default font of Times New Roman, Regular, 10 point with no Underlining, Automatic colour and No effects. Where other fonts are used, the comments will be converted to the default font. This may cause misalignment between columns or loss of information e.g. due to Strikethrough or Highlight changes.
2.	Do not merge, split or adjust cell formatting. This will cause severe distortion of the collated tables of comments, requiring much rework.
3.	Do not apply additional formatting conditions to the tables.

Comment categories

Where comments are not accurately categorized, they may not be accorded the level of attention intended by the commentator.

E	Editorial	Covers spelling, grammar, punctuation and readability problems. These are matters that should be able to be resolved offline by the Project Editor. At worst, it may be necessary to confer with the National Body Head of Delegation.
G	General	Avoid use of this category if at all possible. If the comment is Editorial, it will greatly assist the Project Editor if each occurrence is identified. If it is Technical, then it will be important for every contributing item to be addressed (by individual comments).
TL	Technical Low	Minor problems. For example, earlier Clauses (1, 2, 3), Definitions, Activity/task level
TH	Technical High	Major problems. For example, Architectural (Stage, Process level)

ISO 3166 codes

Minor alterations have been made, for example to cater for INCOSE.

Table 1 - ISO 3166 country codes

ISO 3166 code	Official name	Common name
AUS	Australia	Australia
AUT	Republic of Austria	Austria
BEL	Kingdom of Belgium	Belgium
BRA	Federative Republic of Brazil	Brazil
CAN	Canada	Canada
CHE	Switzerland	Switzerland
CHN	People's Republic of China	China
COL	Republic of Colombia	Colombia
CSK	Czechoslovak Socialist Republic	Czech Republic
DEU	Federal Republic of Germany	Germany
DNK	Denmark	Denmark
EGY	Egypt	Egypt
ESP	Spanish State	Spain
FIN	Republic of Finland	Finland
FRA	French Republic	France
GBR	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	United Kingdom
HUN	Hungarian People's Republic	Hungary
INC	INCOSE	SC 7 Category A liaison
IRL	Ireland	Ireland
ISR	State of Israel	Israel
ITA	Italian Republic	Italy
JPN	Japan	Japan
KOR	Republic of Korea	Korea
MEX	United Mexican States	Mexico
NLD	Kingdom of the Netherlands	Netherlands
NOR	Kingdom of Norway	Norway
NZL	New Zealand	New Zealand
ROM	Socialist Republic of Romania	Romania
SGP	Republic of Singapore	Singapore
SLO	Slovenia	Slovenia
SUN	Russian Federation	Russia
SWE	Kingdom of Sweden	Sweden
USA	United States of America	United States of America
ZAF	Republic of South Africa	South Africa