

## **Comment Disposition Report on CD15476-6(State/Event Models)**

2001.January 19<sup>th</sup> Yuji Shinoki

### **Comment Resolution Proceeding**

1. Comments on WD and CD Registration ballot of 15476-6 until 1996-10-28 are come from Japan, Netherlands, UK, and USA national bodies. Most of the comments are processed through editing meetings held in Walnut Creek (June 1997) and in Kumamoto (October 1998) by Jean Berube.
2. Project editor of this project 7.28.3.9 was changed from Jean Berube(Canada) to Yuji Shinoki(Japan) on SC7 Plenary meeting held in Madrid (May 2000). And new editor edited to make the WD consistent with ISO/IEC 11411 "Information technology – Representation for human communication of state transition of software" and processed rest of the comments.

### **Detailed Disposition**

#### **Comments from JAPAN**

JPN G001:This draft is too early to be registered as CD because there is hardly any discussion about the WD even in the SC7/WG11 meeting.

*Disposition: Withdraw. Because in some WG11 meetings including Walnut Creek meeting(June 1997) and Kumamoto meeting (October 1998), enough discussion have been executed. And Japanese SC7/WG11 members have revised this document consistently with ISO/IEC 11411 "Information technology – Representation for human communication of state transition of software".*

JPN G002:This draft should be corrected in order to conform to the JTC1 Directives.

For example:

- a) The sequence of 'Introduction' and 'Scope' shall be reversed.
- b) Wording of 'Scope' clause shall conform to the Directives.
- c) 'Definition' and 'Normative Reference' clause are missing.
- d) Replace the word 'Appendix' with 'Annex'.

*Disposition: Accepted. All clauses were revised according to directive part 3.*

JPN G003:This draft is premature as Committee Draft because of too many editorial errors. For example:

- a) Several page numbers in table of contents are wrong.
- b) "A2. Details of Example" in APPENDIX A: EXAMPLE does not exist, but just one error message.
- c) The Content of APPENDIX B: QUESTIONS AND ANSWER does not exist.

*Disposition: Accepted. Editorial errors were checked out and corrected.*

## Comments from NETHERLANDS

NET G001:Overall comments.

The set of documents appear to be closely related to (and building upon) each other, while there is little reference to other documents. Most notably references to ISO standards are (almost) completely missing. Furthermore, the documents do not follow at all the ISO guidelines for drafting and presentation of International Standards (ISO Directives, Part 3).

When such a set of self-standing documents is to be transposed into international standards there are in principle 2 routes: either fast-track the documents (through a National Body or via the PAS route) or by using the normal 5-stage process. The advantage of the fast-track route is that (at least for the initial version of the standard) the directives part 3 do not need to be applied. However, if the 5-stage approach is taken (and that is apparently the case) then the documents should be rewritten to conform to the directives.

*Disposition: Accepted. Same as JPN G002.*

## Comments from UK

UK G001:The UK votes against registration of WD 15476-6 as it is not yet a complete, mature draft.

*Disposition: Accepted. Same as JPN G002.*

## Comments from USA

USA G001:Comment - Needs to be in ISO formatting conventions

*Disposition: Accepted. Same as JPN G002.*